

Improving Girl Education in Pakistan

(Syed Muhammad Farrulsaqlain)

Introduction

This paper presents a strategy to improve girl education in Pakistan. Recognizing that national policies are important tools and have major impact on educational outcomes, this paper will focus on the management issues associated with girls' education in Pakistan. Operational capacity issues are at the heart of this problem. These issues are one of the major hurdles in the achievement of universal girl education in Pakistan. Political authority, parents, and socio-cultural-economic factors, which make up the authorizing environment, are also important. However, this paper proposes that by addressing operational capacity issues, the goal of universal girls' enrolment can be achieved. This paper has been divided into several sections. Section 1 discusses the background of the problem. Section 2 discusses the key issues associated with the problem. Section 3 discusses some alternative solutions to the problem. Section 4 discusses preferred solution to the problem. Last section concludes the paper.

Background

Education plays critical role in the development of a country, reducing poverty, and helping achieve better standards of living for its citizens. It creates new opportunities for socially and economically deprived sections of the population. Without educating the female population, achievement of better and higher standards of living is not possible. It is now believed that female education increases child schooling (Ray 2000). Girl education increases income, both at the individual as well as at the national levels. Women receive

higher returns to their investment in schooling (Psacharopoulos and Patrinos 2002). Female education results in more productive farming and faster economic growth. Educated mothers are more likely to send their children to schools than uneducated ones (Ray 2000). Some studies have found that educating girls leads to smaller and sustainable families (Klasen 1999).

Pakistan is committed to United Nations' Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Goal 2 is achieving Universal Primary Education by 2015, and Goal 3 is Promoting Gender Equality and Women Empowerment (Country Report 2013). Universal primary education cannot be achieved without female education. Unfortunately, progress towards achieving these goals is very slow, and it is highly unlikely for Pakistan to be able to achieve these goals by 2015. Pakistan is one of those countries where there are inequalities in access to education between boys and girls. There are social, cultural, and economic factors that are responsible for placing girls at disadvantage with regard to access to education and completion. One approach to address this issue is through public spending. Those who support this approach argue that more expenditure on primary education can alter the situation for females with regard to their access to education and their economic empowerment (Sabir and Abdullah 2003). Others believe that there are social-cultural barriers to female mobility, which need to be removed to achieve the goal of universal primary education (Callum et al 2012). There are some 22.15 million children of primary age (5-9 yo) in Pakistan, majority of which live in the rural areas. A study of the Ministry of Education, Pakistan, estimated that 32% of primary age children are out of school (Country Report 2013). 68% children of primary school age could be enrolled by the end of 2012. In

girls, the percentage is 63% as compared to 73% for boys (Country Report 2013). Higher drop out rate among the girls is a very serious issue. The primary school completion rate for the boys, in rural areas, is three times higher than for girls; in urban areas it is twice as high (Herz and Sperling 2004). There is a decline of about 3.8 percent in the number of primary schools between 2006 and 2012. Since 2006 a decline of 1.7 percent in girls' enrolment at primary level has been recorded (Economic Survey 2012-13).

Key issues

Improving girls' education is a complex issue. There are many internal and external factors that are responsible for the production of this important public value. Government policies, resource allocation, political and social support, capacity of the implementing agencies, and management style are some of the key factors. Government has introduced many national education policies and special plans to improve education indicators (Malik 2007). Like other developing countries, Pakistan is also faced with resource gap. Foreign aid agencies have provided substantial amount of foreign aid over the years for the improvement of education indicators. Asian Development Bank, World Bank, IMF, Canadian International Development Agency, UK's Department for International Development, AusAID, and European Commission are some of the major donors in the education sector of Pakistan. Recent years have witnessed an upward trend in foreign aid for education sector to enable Pakistan to achieve Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). This brief overview suggests that policies were in place; reasonable resources were available, yet Pakistan could not achieve its education sector targets.

The key issue, therefore, is lack of operational capacity to deliver the mission, which is universal primary enrolment and gender equity. This paper will focus on the management issues related to girls' education. Operational capacity is an important component of Moore's (1995) strategic triangle. Without sufficient capacity public managers are not able to produce public value. Education sector in Pakistan is rampant with capacity issues. Teachers are the key factor in any education system (Memon 2007). Female teachers are essential for girls' schools. At the primary level there are some 196514 female teachers (46%) as against 228545 male teachers (54%) (Economic Survey 2013-13). In a country where female population is more than the male population, more female teachers are required to cater for the education needs of the female population. Research in other developing countries has shown that having female teachers encourage girls' enrolment (Herz and Sperling 2004). Fewer female teachers mean larger classes and poor quality of education. Quality of education is an important issue because parents' decision about girls' education is sometimes dependent on the provision of good quality education (Alderman et al 2001). Quality comes with small class size, trained teachers, and provision of classroom materials. Herz and Sperling (2004) argue that class size should be 40 students, which is manageable and ensures quality education.

Teachers' training is also very important. A study in Switzerland established the link between teachers' training and rise in girls' enrolment (Muzaffar 2011). Studies in Bangladesh and Kenya have shown that demand for education increases more in girls than boys with quality of teaching (Lloyd et al 2000). The issue in Pakistan is limited training to teachers, which does not equip them with necessary tools to make teaching experience pleasant for the students. Related to teachers' training is the level of teachers' own

education. Grade 10 education is required for primary school teachers. Several studies have shown that students' performance is closely related to number of years of teacher's formal education (Memon 2007). It is also true that finding women with sufficient education is not easy, especially in the rural areas. Educational shortcomings can be addressed by providing proper training.

Girls' education is different than boys' education because girls have different requirements. The education department views them alike which creates problems. Making schools more girl-friendly will encourage parents to send their girls to schools. From basic facilities to mobility, everything needs to be planned differently for girls' schools. For example, provision of latrines in girls' schools had a positive effect on girls' enrolment in many African and Asian countries (Lloyd et al 2005). Parents are more likely to send their girls to schools, which provide boundary walls, toilets, and safety within the school building.

Another key issue is accountability and transparency in the management of education sector. Education in Pakistan is a devolved subject. Provinces are responsible for education. Below the provincial education department are district education offices, responsible for looking after the schools in the district. The provincial education department allocates budget, which consists of salaries mostly. Provincial headquarters approves development schemes for schools in the district. This highly centralized system places too much power and authority in the hands of provincial managers. Long chain of command allows avenues for corruption. Local community has no say in the whole process. Managers at the provincial level have no idea what is required at the local level. This creates even more problem in the case of girls' schools. There is a huge mismatch between

what is required and what is provided. Centralized system of purchase suits the people in the provincial department. Bulk purchases mean more money for the provincial officials. This kind of attitude creates frustration in the parents and negatively impacts their decision to send their girls to school.

Related to the centralized governance is the issue of budget and its utilization. Cumbersome budgetary procedures take ages for developmental schemes to get approved. Demands submitted during one year are approved in the next. This problem was highlighted during the devastating earthquake of 2008 and massive floods of 2010. Many schools were destroyed as a result of these natural calamities. Majority of girls' schools lost their boundary walls, and classrooms. Though schools opened after sometime, but classes were held under the open sky. For boys it was not much of a problem. But for girls it presented a practical problem. Parents were reluctant to send their girls to schools without walls. Lengthy budgetary procedures took two years to rebuild girls' schools. As a result most of the girls discontinued their studies. If the procedures were simple and funds were available to local offices, rebuilding could have been started much earlier, without losing too many girl students.

Lastly, there is hardly any women representation in the education department. District level officers are predominantly male. They cannot fully understand girls' problems. An obvious result of this lack of understanding is that demands submitted by girls' schools are seldom sent to the provincial education department. The Provincial government remains unaware of the real requirement of the rural girls' schools. This disconnect between the policy makers and the field staff is responsible for dysfunctional

girls' education system in Pakistan. Women managers can better manage girls' education. They can make schools more girls friendly and boost girls' enrolment.

Moore's Strategic Triangle

Mark Moore published his book *Creating Public Value: Strategic Management in Government* (1995). In this book Moore presented the concept of Public Value framework. The concept of public value creation by public managers is understood through strategic triangle that explains what are the three key calculations, which public managers have to make to create public value (Moore 1995). The issue of girls' enrolment in Pakistan is analyzed within this strategic triangle.

First component of the strategic triangle is public value that the public manager creates. Public value is the purpose or mission of the organization, which it is pursuing (Moore 2000). Public value is something that is substantively valuable (Alford and O'Flynn 2009). Public value is defined as the aspirations of a community as a whole, determined also by the representative government and products and services that the markets cannot produce naturally (Moore 1995). Seen in this context educating female population is public value. Several studies have confirmed that there is a direct link between female education and economic growth (Herz and Sperling 2004). Female education contributes in faster economic growth, productive farming, smaller; sustainable families, reduction in infant mortality, ensures child education, and overall women empowerment (Jejeebhoy and Sathar 2001). However, in Pakistan public manager has to operate within the tension that exists between the public value of educating girls and socio-cultural norms of the society. Girls' education is not taken as economically beneficial as boys' education (Memon 2007).

In cultures where daughters are married out of their families, parents see little incentive for educating their girls (Boyle et al 2002). Cost of education is another issue that impacts parents' decision. The problem is particularly serious in rural areas, where feudal culture discourages female education. These feudal are also in politics and sit in the legislative assemblies. That is why there is no strong legislation regarding girls' education. A public manager has to operate within strong tension between public value of female education and socio-cultural norms on the one hand, and between public value and politics on the other.

Second component of Moore's strategic triangle is legitimacy and support. Public manager has to decide where the legitimacy and support for the public value will come from (Moore 2000). The authorizing environment answers such questions as who is going to provide resources and who has the power to authorize it. There are different actors in the authorizing environment who behave differently. Some have direct influence while others have indirect influence over the production of public value. For public sector organization the authorizing environment consists of political leadership, citizens, interest groups, community organizations, and media (Moore 2000). Public manager has to ensure consistent support and legitimacy from all these actors. Without the support of the political authority, there will be no resources available for the production of public value. Similarly, if the citizens and interest groups are not aligned with the purpose of the organization, public value will not remain public.

In the case of girls' education in Pakistan, government is the main actor, which provides resources and legitimacy to organization's work. Constitution of Pakistan guarantees right to education for all the citizens, irrespective of gender or social status.

Legal legitimacy is there, but support in terms of adequate resources is lacking. Government spending on education is less than 3 percent of GDP. Despite international assistance for education, there is still a huge gap between available and required resources. Public sector organization relies on the resources provided by the government through budget allocations. Several studies have confirmed relationship between public spending on education and educational outcomes (Malik 2007). The United Nations announced Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) in 2000. The MDGs are to be achieved by 2015. Since the announcement of MDGs, substantial amount of foreign aid came to Pakistan, but primary enrolment rate could not go higher than 57 percent. No public sector organization can achieve its targets if adequate resources are not provided.

Community's support is essential for female education. If citizens are not convinced about the public value of female education, they are not aligned with the organization's purpose. In a traditional society people do not send their girls to school. In the urban areas this trend is changing in favour of girls' education. The problem is particularly serious in the rural areas. Parents want safety, easy access to school, security, and availability of basic facilities. People in the rural areas are poor and cannot afford the cost of education. They justify their decision of not sending girls to schools on the socio-cultural grounds. However, in recent years government has provided cash incentives for parents who send their girls to school. This strategy has worked in some areas, but incentivizing girls' education is very expensive. Furthermore, it is not sustainable in the long run. Attitudinal change will ensure people's complete support for female education.

Media has the capacity to generate enormous support for any issue. It can change public opinion overnight (Herz and Sperling 2004). Media has the ability to influence

people's attitude towards girls' education. Unfortunately, media have not raised awareness about girls' education, as it should have. Media should run such awareness campaigns in the rural areas where there is reluctance towards girls' education. People in the urban areas have positive attitude towards girls' education because of media availability in these areas. In the rural areas people have limited access to media. Media's support for the public value of female education is very important.

Authorizing environment is a crowded place, full of actors and players who have different behaviours and perspectives on issues. It is a complex environment. In the public sector organization, creation of public value is a complex process. In Pakistan's case all the actors in the authorizing environment need to be brought to a consensus to support female education.

Third component of Moore's strategic triangle is operational capacity. These are the necessary know-how and capabilities that are required to achieve desired results (Moore 2000). These capabilities mostly lie inside the organization, but sometimes lie outside the organization. The analysis of organizational capacity answers such questions as what are the capabilities that are required? Are these developed or need to be developed? Whether inside the organization or outside? In other words, it is operational and administrative feasibility (Alford and O'Flynn 2009). These capabilities have to be in alignment with other two components of legitimacy and support, and public value. If the financial resources, legitimacy and support are available, public value to be created is clear, but without capacity to achieve it, the organization cannot create public value. An important aspect of operational capacity is working with other organizations to acquire the required capabilities. This makes the creation of public value as sole purpose of the public sector

organization, even if it has to rely on the outside environment. Increasingly, public sector organizations all over the World are collaborating with private sector for technological assistance (Sathar and Lloyd 1994).

In the case of girls' education in Pakistan, operational capacity is perhaps the most important issue. Lack of capacity in the organization is the prime cause for poor service delivery. Teachers are not properly trained. Their educational levels are very low. The result is poor quality of education, which fails to generate interest in the students. Several studies have established link between teacher's formal education and students' retention rate at primary level (Memon 2007). Lack of facilities in the girls' schools negatively impacts parents' decision to send their girls to school. Availability of facilities is linked with an effective monitoring and evaluation system. If there is a proper check as to what facilities are required and how the existing facilities are being maintained by the school administration, most of the schools will be up to date. Managers have no capacity to design effective monitoring tools. Reporting system is very poor and there is no way of verifying these reports. Managers are not trained to prepare development plans. Need assessment of schools is never done. No female are working in the district education offices, making it difficult for the female teachers to convey their concerns effectively. There are hardly any changes in the old curriculum, because there are no experts of curriculum development. A new curriculum is needed that discourages gender stereotypes and encourages gender equity and portray women as equal partners in development.

The situation discussed above points to lack of alignment among the three components of strategic triangle. To achieve desired results, authorizing environment has to provide legitimacy and support to the girls' education. Community has to accept girls'

education as public value. Operational capacity has to be enhanced, which is the focus of this paper.

Alternative Solutions

Option 1

Option 1 takes the approach of managing outward, working with private sector organizations and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). Alford and O’Flynn (2012) have discussed types of coordination and distribution roles between government and external actors. One is outsourcing and contracting, where a principal-agent relationship is developed. The agent carries out the work on behalf of the principal, because principal assumes efficiency in the work of the agent. These kinds of relationships require legal contracts, which lay out specifications, commitments, performance measurement, financial details, and contract termination clauses. In this model the agent wholly produces the service. The second type is partnership and collaboration (Alford and O’Flynn 2012). It is based on co-production of service by government and external partner. This model relies on collaboration, trust, and sharing of commitment. Level of collaboration depends on the type of service being produced. Here, the parties decide about the modes/levels of communications and decision-making mechanisms that facilitate smooth production of service to achieve desired standards. This is an ever-evolving model. Working with each other brings out issues that ask for more or less collaboration, rearranging tasks and roles and moving towards greater or lesser autonomy in decision-making. Trust and mission sharing is an important element of collaborative relationship. Public-Private Partnership

(PPP), Community partnership, Joined-up government are some of collaborative partnership types (Alford and O'Flynn 2012).

Option 1 relies on the second type of coordination that is collaboration with the private sector and NGOs in improving girls' education. Government does not have enough resources to cater for girls' education. The situation is particularly bad in the rural areas. Government can collaborate with the private sector and encourage them to open schools in the rural areas. Schools closer to community boost girls' education by making schools a practical option (Burney 1991). There are many schools in the rural areas that are dysfunctional. These schools are located in remote areas. Education department does not have the capacity to keep an effective check on all of these schools. Private sector can run the administration of these schools. Collaboration with private sector has produced good results in several developing countries (Andrabi et al 2010). In this arrangement, government provides school, while private partner runs the administration of the school. Government gives remuneration to private partner on per student basis. More students attending the school mean more remuneration for the private partner. In some arrangements private partner collects a small fee from the students, the government subsidizes the difference. This kind of collaboration ensures regular classes, teachers' presence in the school, improved enrolment and better quality of education.

Government can also collaborate in the area of teachers' training. Teachers at the primary level have very little formal education. They are not given training on modern lines, which results in lack of interest in their job. Disinterested teachers produce low quality of education. Several studies have shown that quality of teaching is linked with demand for education for girls (Alderman et al 2001). Government can collaborate with

NGOs to provide training to public sector teachers. Similarly, leading private schools can also be engaged to provide training to female teachers. There is a lot of difference in teaching styles and techniques of public and private schools. Female teachers from the rural schools can learn new teaching methods and handling of small children in private schools.

Hundreds of girls' schools in Pakistan are without basic facilities. A World Bank study found that parents require toilets for girls' schools in Pakistan (Herz and Sperling 2004). Boundary wall is important in girls' schools because of socio-cultural considerations. Many schools are without classroom requirements such as desks, chairs, blackboards, fans, and drinking water. A pleasant learning experience increases enrolment and decreases dropout rate (Memon 2007). NGOs can provide such facilities. Many non-profit organizations and international donor agencies are already providing some of these facilities in many schools. However, these efforts are not organized and result in duplication. Government can coordinate these efforts by allocating different areas or schools where the facilities are needed.

School availability and girls' mobility have direct effect on girls' schooling (Callum et al 2012). Majority of schools are located at a distance from the community. A study found that parents were more likely to send their girls to schools if the schools were located inside the communities or at a distance of two kilometers or less (Lloyd et al 2005). A higher percentage of dropouts amongst girls have been recorded in communities where schools are situated far away from the communities (Afridi 2006). This gender specific restraint on mobility is not limited to girl students only; it has a direct impact on female teachers too. Mobility issue not only impacts girls' enrolment but quality of education and

availability of teachers as well. Government can collaborate with private sector or NGOs to provide free transport for students and teachers. Government can subsidize this scheme or donor agencies can be engaged to share the expenses. The issue of mobility is important because it is the first thing parents think about while taking the decision about girl education. When asked only 34 percent parents allowed 15 year old girls to go alone to school (Callum et al 2012).

Lack of awareness about girls' education is a big issue. Parents do not see any economic benefit in girls' education. People in the rural community are not aware of the long-term benefits of female education. Rural population has very limited access to print or electronic media. In this regard collaboration with NGOs could prove fruitful. Government can coordinate the efforts of NGOs by devising a comprehensive plan of raising awareness about girls' education in those communities where girls' enrolment rate is very low.

Option 1 will enhance the capacity of the education department and will bring improvement in girls' enrolment. However, option 1 has some limitations. Firstly, the scope of problem is so big that private sector or NGOs will not be able to provide services to all the girls' schools. Private education sector does not have the capacity to manage all the girls' schools. Most NGOs have limited budgets, enough to take care of their own programs. NGOs' financial capacity has declined since 2000, when MDGs were announced. There has been a shift in foreign donor agencies' funding from executing stand-alone projects to budgetary support and policy reforms (Sabir and Abdullah 2003). This shift has resulted in diversion of large amounts of foreign aid to government budget support. Now NGOs receive very little amount to carry out small projects. NGOs cannot provide basic facilities or transport for all the girls' schools in the rural area.

Secondly, private sector is motivated by profit concern. Most of the private schools are located in urban areas for this very reason. People in the urban areas have higher income levels and better standard of living. They can afford private schools. In contrast, people in the rural cannot even afford books and other materials. Even if private schools are opened in the rural areas, not many will be able to afford it. If government decides to subsidize private schools in the rural areas, it will create another problem. It will attract a large number of private actors to benefit from the scheme. Government will not be able to arrange resources for all such private schools. The amount that will be used for subsidy can be utilized to open new schools closer to community.

Thirdly, enhancement of teachers' capacity through private sector schools and NGOs begs the question of capacity of private sector. It will take considerable amount of time. Moreover, it will cause huge displacement of teachers. Most of the private schools are located in the urban areas. Will the female teachers from rural areas be able to attend training in cities? The answer is no, because same socio-cultural constraints apply on female teachers as these apply on female students. We have seen that schools located more than two kilometers from the community create mobility problem for female students and teachers alike.

Fourthly, handing over management of the government girls' schools to private sector seems a reasonable option that require further research. However, this option is also limited by the scope of the problem. There are hundreds of schools that need better management. Private partners will not be able to take the responsibility for all the schools. The problem is severe in remote areas, where no private party is willing to go.

There are differences between social and private returns, which is why primary education all over the World is government funded (Malik 2007). Primary education is the foundation stone for future education. It involves issues like distance from home to school, education quality, affordability for the poor, subsidies wherever required, and curriculum that reflects national aspirations. Because of these issues government's spending on education is directly linked with educational outcomes. Private sector or NGOs can play their limited part, but they cannot cater for the requirements of the whole system.

Option 2

Option 2 approaches the question of capacity enhancement by looking inside the organization that is managing downward and inward. This option assumes that by bringing changes in the way girls' education is managed; we can improve girls' enrolment at primary level.

There are not enough female teachers in Pakistan. There has been a decline of 3.9 percent in female teachers since 2006 (Callum et al 2012). Increase in the number of female teachers is the first step towards building capacity to cater for the needs of female students. Many studies have shown that girls will enroll if female teachers teach them. Parents often show concern that sending girls to school may expose them to physical or sexual abuse (Herz and Sperling 2004). In a conservative society girls are shy and hesitate asking questions from male teachers. Hiring female teachers is also not easy. Teachers in the cities are not willing to teach in remote villages because of their husbands' job or distance. One way of solving this problem is to hire local female teachers to teach in the

community. Experience has shown that community teachers are more eager and well situated to teach in rural areas (Burney 1991). Community teacher can perform well at primary level. In recent years hiring of female teachers has encouraged the parents to send girls to schools, because these female teachers have provided useful role models (Muzaffar and Bari 2010). The appointment of female teachers will not only increase girls' enrolment, but will also contribute towards women economic empowerment.

Sometimes, parents' decision about girls' education hinges on the quality of education. Quality can be improved through teachers' training and curriculum development. Old methods of teaching discourage student participation. More interactive ways of learning can encourage students to attend school regularly. Several studies have shown that pleasant learning experience increases girls' enrolment (Fullan and Watson 2000). In Swaziland, teachers' training in curriculum contents and participatory learning resulted in girls' enrolment equal to boys (Muzaffar 2011). In South Asia, teachers with insufficient education were able to teach effectively after getting training in lesson plan and curriculum content (Memon 2007).

Curriculum should be such that equip the children with the challenges of the 21st century. Curriculum based on science and interactive learning generates students' interest in the studies and ensures continuity of schooling. In Kenya and Bangladesh research indicated that quality of education resulted in demand for girls' education even more than boys (Herz and Sperling 2004).

Making schools more girl-friendly is the next step. Socio-cultural considerations require privacy and security for girls. Private latrines in girls' schools are necessary for cultural as well as practical reasons. This becomes a serious concern when the girls are

reaching adolescence. A study in Pakistan found that most of the parents expect a solid boundary wall and latrine in girls' schools (Andrabi et al 2010). Provision of all female staff in girls' schools will also help making girls comfortable within the school.

Mobility is another problem for girls. Parents fear for the safety of their girls while going to or coming from the school. Where schools are within the community or at two kilometers distance, attendance has increased considerably (Callum et al 2012). Establishing new schools within the community or in close proximity can solve the problem of mobility. In Egypt, girls' enrolment increased by 60 percent by building schools closer to community (Herz and Sperling 2004).

Community involvement in local schools can boost girls' enrolment. Research has shown that community participation in school affairs increases students' enrolment (Fullan and Watson 2000). Community involvement can check teachers' absenteeism, ensures quality of education, and availability of basic facilities. Community can be involved to establish community schools. In Colombia and Mali community schools helped raised girls' enrolment by 60 percent (Latif 2011). Community involvement will help enhance the capacity of the education department to keep an effective check on the performance of rural schools.

Decentralization of authority is an important issue. Present system is highly centralized. The developmental budget lies with the provincial authority, while only the salary budget is transferred to the districts. Centralization of decision-making authority does not allow even for small matters to get solved. Petty routine matters like repairs or annual white wash need provincial approval. Here, government is required to relax the rules in favour of more autonomy to local schools by placing some budgets at their

disposal. It is particularly important for girls' schools, because lack of facilities in the schools can make the parents stop sending girls to schools. A decentralized system will also ensure accountability at the local level. Community involvement in purchase and building will ensure transparency and quality of work. Timely decision at the local level will ensure continuity of girls' education. Decentralization will simplify budget procedures and fund will be readily available for the local schools. Centralized system also creates opportunities for corruption because of the multiplicity of actors. Decentralized budgeting, on the other hand, curbs corruption and make local officials accountable to the community.

Women can best understand women problems. There are very few women in the management of education department. The number of women should increase. Female teachers find it easier to talk to the women managers. These women managers can better understand female schools' problems. Training to management staff is necessary. There is no education management training. All over the world education has become a specialized field. People dealing with education need to be abreast with current trends in education delivery, curriculum development, planning, and teachers' training. The officials also need training in addressing the socio-cultural concerns of the community. Education planners should be able to devise plans for each area according to its socio-cultural sensitivity.

Incentives, motivations, and behavioral changes are important in public management. Quality of education can be assessed by regularly testing children achievement. Good results should be rewarded. This will motivate the teachers to produce good results. Quality of education results in higher levels of satisfaction among the students as well as parents. Research suggests that parents' satisfaction with studies contributes to continuity of girls' education (Filmer and Pritchett 1999).

Lastly, effective monitoring and evaluation mechanism is very important. The phenomenon of ghost schools in Pakistan emerged due to weak monitoring. Officials hardly visit the schools, especially in the rural areas. They rely on paper reports, which are normally misrepresentation of facts. Ghost schools were those schools that existed on paper only. This situation emerged because nobody visited the schools. Public managers need to enhance their capacity in monitoring and evaluation and should devise effective systems to check on the performance of schools.

Preferred Option

Option 2 is preferred because it relies on organization's own capabilities to enhance operational capacity. This option does not involve any extra funds. It requires alignment of operational capacity with the public value of female education. Government establishes female schools every year. Option 2 asks for these schools to be built within the community or close proximity. Teachers' training is a routine matter, it needs reorientation towards adopting new techniques of teaching to make learning experience pleasant one for the students. Government has to strengthen its teachers' training institutes. Decentralization of authority is essential for timely decision-making to save resources and ensure accountability of officials to the community. It will help solve local issues at local level. Making schools girl-friendly is imperative to increase girls' enrolment. It includes provision of basic facilities according to socio-cultural norms. The success of option 2 depends on an effective monitoring mechanism. Regular physical monitoring is required to ensure good quality education, teachers' presence, and availability of basic facilities.

Conclusion

This paper has analyzed the problem of girls' enrolment at primary level in Pakistan. There are issues of authorizing environment, recognition of female education as public value, and operational capacity. Focusing on operational capacity, the paper concludes that operational capacity can be enhanced to create public value by ensuring availability of trained female teachers, quality of education, making schools girl-friendly in line with socio-cultural requirements, improving access to schools, community participation, decentralization, inclusion of women in management, simple budget procedures, training for the managers, incentives for the teachers, and an effective monitoring and evaluation mechanism. These actions will enhance operational capacity to improve girls' enrolment at primary level.

References:

- Afridi, Z. (2006). Pakistan's Primary Education Quality Improvement Program: Local Partners Work with Rural Communities to Support High Quality Education for Girls. *Academy For Educational Development*.
- Alderman, H., Orazem, P., & Paterno, E. (2001). School quality, school cost, and the public/private school choices of low-income households in Pakistan. *Journal Of Human Resources*, 304--326.
- Alford, J., & O'Flynn, J. (2012). *Rethinking public service delivery* (1st ed.). Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Andrabi, T., Das, J., & Khwaja, A. (2010). Education policy in Pakistan: a framework for reform. *International Growth Centre-Pakistan*.
- Boyle, S., Brock, A., Mace, J., & Sibbons, M. (2002). Reaching the Poor: The 'Costs' of Sending Children to School: A Six Country Comparative Study, Synthesis Report.
- Burney, N., & Irfan, M. (1991). Parental characteristics, supply of schools, and child school-enrolment in Pakistan. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 21--62.

- Callum, C., Sathar, Z., & ul Haque, M. (2012). IS MOBILITY THE MISSING LINK IN IMPROVING GIRLS'SCHOOLING IN PAKISTAN?. *Asian Population Studies*, 8(1), 5--22.
- Country Report Pakistan 2013-15, Accelerating Millennium Development Goals. Ministry of Education Pakistan. (April 2013). Retrieved from moptt.gov.pk/publications
- Filmer, D., & Pritchett, L. (1999). The effect of household wealth on educational attainment: evidence from 35 countries. *Population And Development Review*, 25(1), 85--120.
- Fullan, M., & Watson, N. (2000). School-based management: Reconceptualizing to improve learning outcomes. *School effectiveness and school improvement*, 11(4), 453-473.
- Herz, B., & Sperling, G. B. (2004). *What works in girls' education: evidence and policies from the developing world / Barbara Herz and Gene B. Sperling*. New York: Council on Foreign Relations, c2004.
- Jejeebhoy, S., & Sathar, Z. (2001). Women's autonomy in India and Pakistan: the influence of religion and region. *Population And Development Review*, 27(4), 687--712.
- Klasen, S. (1999). "Does Gender Inequality Reduce Growth and Development? Evidence from Cross-Country Regressions." Policy Research Report on Gender and Development Working Paper No. 7. Washington, D.C.: World Bank.
- Latif, A. (2011). Alarming situation of education in Pakistan. Retrieved from www.unesco.org/education/efa
- Lloyd, C., Kaufman, C., & Hewett, P. (2000). The Spread of Primary Schooling in Sub-Saharan Africa: Implications for Fertility Change. *Population And Development Review*, 26(3), 483--515.
- Lloyd, C., Mete, C., & Sathar, Z. (2005). The effect of gender differences in primary school access, type, and quality on the decision to enroll in rural Pakistan. *Economic Development And Cultural Change*, 53(3), 685--710.
- Malik, R. (2007). Aid Effectiveness and the Role of Donor Intervention in the Education Sector in Pakistan: A Review of Issues and Literature (No. 6). RECOUP Working Paper.
- Memon, G. R. (2007). Education in Pakistan: The key issues, problems and the new challenges. *Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 3(1), 47-55.
- Moore, H. M. (1995) *Creating Public Value: Strategic Management in Government*, Harvard University Press, Cambridge.

- Moore, M. H. (2000). Managing for value: Organizational strategy in for-profit, nonprofit, and governmental organizations. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 29(suppl 1), 183-208.
- Muzaffar, I. (2011). Education Reforms in Pakistan: Through Popular Demand or Political Activism? *Social Science and Policy Bulletin*, 3(2), 10-14
- Muzaffar, I., & Bari, F. (2010). Education debate in Pakistan: Barking up the wrong tree? *Social Science and Policy Bulletin*, 1(4), 3-6.
- Pakistan Economic Survey 2012-13. Retrieved from finance.gov.pk/survey_1213.html on 25 May 2014
- Psacharopoulos, G, and Patrinos. H. (2002). "Returns to Investment in Education: A Further Update." World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 2881 Washington, D.C.: World Bank.
- Ray, R. (2000). Analysis of child labour in Peru and Pakistan: A comparative study. *Journal of Population Economics*, 13(1), 3-19
- Sabir, M., and Abdullah, T. (2003). Gender and Public Spending on Education in Pakistan: A Case Study of Disaggregated Benefit Incidence. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 41(4), 477-493
- Sathar, Z. A., & Lloyd, C. B. (1994). Who gets primary schooling in Pakistan: inequalities among and within families. *Pakistan Development Review*, 33(ii), 103-114.